

City of Piedmont
COUNCIL AGENDA REPORT

DATE: May 2, 2022

TO: Mayor and Council

FROM: Sara Lillevand, City Administrator

SUBJECT: Receipt of the Piedmont Community Pool Design Development Package and Consideration of 1) Approval of Design Modifications to the Recreation Pool; and 2) Authorization for Staff and ELS to Advance to Construction Documents Phase

RECOMMENDATION:

Receive the 100% Design Development Package and Cost Estimate for the Piedmont Community Pool Project and by a single motion, take the following actions with regard to the project:

- 1) Approve design modifications to the shallow water recreation pool as recommended by the Community Pool Advisory Committee (PAC):
 - a) Lap Lanes: increased length of the three lap lanes from 20 to 25 yards with a depth profile that moves side to side from approximately 3.5 feet in the middle of the pool to approximately 5 feet at the western edge of the pool
 - b) Rotate the stairs 90 degrees such that the stairs enter the open free water area rather than the rectangular lap lane area
- 2) Approve expansion of the zero-beach entry area in the recreation pool by approximately 300 square feet
- 3) Authorize Staff and ELS to advance to Construction Documents Phase

BACKGROUND

At its meetings of March 21, 2022 and April 4, 2022, the City Council made changes to the conceptual design and directed staff to proceed with an accelerated timeline for bringing the Piedmont Community Pool project to bid due to construction cost hyperinflation. The design alterations prioritized the aquatics needs of the community and focused primarily on reductions in the building. While the vast majority of cost reductions came from the building and there were no proposed changes to the deep water competition pool, the configuration of the recreation pool was modified to reduce the length of the three lap lanes in the recreation pool from 25 yards to 20 yards, as well as a significant reduction in the size of the zero-depth entry area.

On March 21st, Council directed staff and ELS to continue to proceed into the Design Development Phase with the significant modifications to the Community Pool building as presented along with a request for further exploration of maintaining 25-yard lap lanes in the

recreation pool as well as potential fundraising mechanisms.

On April 4th, Council reviewed and affirmed refinement of the building alterations as well as directed staff to continue the review of program and cost considerations related to 20-yard versus 25-yard recreation pool lap lanes and present the analysis to the PAC for its review and recommendation to the City Council. In addition, Council also directed staff to prepare a donation policy to allow the quick activation of community members to make private contributions toward elements of the pool project which have been or may be cut from the design.

Community Pool Advisory Committee Recommendation

On April 26, 2022, the PAC considered the programming implications of the configuration of the lap lanes in the recreation pool. The PAC received an architectural presentation by Clarence Mamuyac of ELS as well as a programming presentation by Stuart Isaac of Isaac Sports Group. The PAC was unanimous in its recommendation to revert to the original 25 yard lap lanes in the recreation pool. Based upon the programming analysis, the depth profile of these lap lanes was discussed in detail and resulted in a recommendation that the depth within the rectangular area increase from side to side rather than from end to end. The PAC also affirmed and recommended the stairs be rotated 90 degrees away from the lap lanes as discussed at previous Council meetings. These recommendations support maximum program flexibility and cost recovery opportunities for this pool. Although not formally considered by the PAC, the committee discussed and affirmed the benefits of maximizing the amount of 3 to 3.5 foot water in the open water area of the recreation pool which is accomplished by the addition of the recommended expansion of pool surface area at the north end (zero-beach entry) of the pool.

Fiscal Impact of Recommended Modifications

The additional upfront cost to increase the length of the lap lanes to 25 yards and to add roughly 300 square feet of open free water in the recreation pool is approximately \$250,000. This is inclusive of two additional heat pumps to accommodate heating the additional water volume. Staff is confident that in partnership with the Piedmont Recreational Facilities Organization (PRFO), adequate funds can be raised to cover this differential.

Design Development Package and Updated Cost Estimate

The City expects to receive the 100% Design Development package on April 30 subsequent to the publication of this report. When received, the package will be added as a supplement to this report. The City has been advised that cost estimates associated with the Design Development package are in line with estimates presented on April 4, 2022, thus staff recommends advancing the design to the Construction Documents phase.

Item #5 – Piedmont Community Pool Design Update & Related Actions
Correspondence Received Before 3:30 p.m. on Monday, May 2nd

I'm a Piedmont resident writing to wish for a community pool that has a shallow portion where I can stand up in and not tread water. I'm 5'3" and not the best swimmer. I would not feel uncomfortable and if my children were younger, would not be able to help them learn.

Thank you,
Kimery Leong

Dear City Council,

I am super excited about the prospect of a new community pool. I am concerned that the pool may not have an intermediate section for the community. The small pool is wonderful for the little kids and families. The large pool is great for lap swimming and water polo. But where does everyone in between swim?

Shallow lanes are needed in the large pool so that adults, teenagers, tweens, and families that like to chat, relax, throw a ball, or teach a kid more swimming skills can hang without treading water the whole time. And not by throwing a platform in. Platforms get dingy, slippery, and it takes staff to put them in and out.

I attended the pre-final design community pool presentations and participated in the breakout group discussions. This is a point all of the breakout groups raised that night. To say that this point has not been raised would be incorrect. Every table at the formal presentation and small group said in some way that shallow lanes were needed in the big pool.

We want a community pool that offers something for the whole community.

Thank you, Anne Marie Miguel

Hi,

I am very excited about the new pool complex. My family are all swimmers and can't wait for it to be completed, it will be an amazing addition to the community and town.

For the large pool, I would love to have a few shallow lanes that transition into the 7ft deep end. It is too big a leap to go from the smaller shallow pool directly into an all 7ft deep large pool. How will new swimmers feel comfortable learning to swim? Even old swimmers don't like to tread water every second they are in the pool. Please consider the wider community and install a transition from the shallow to the deep end in the large pool.

Thank you,

Heather Chan

City Council members,

Just found out that the entire new pool will be 7 feet deep. You must have a few shallow lanes. This pool is for the whole community not just water polo. Kids and adults need a place to stand. Please consider this in your planning.

Respectfully,
Beverly Bucci

Dear members of the City Council,

Passing the new pool off as a community pool is a dirty trick. Since when is a pool 7 feet deep end to end and side to side something that a family friendly community can use? If I'm understanding the proposal for this new pool correctly, you are betraying the people you represent by billing the new pool as family friendly.

I'm not sure that my husband and I will join the new pool complex. That said, I've taken water aerobics classes at the old pool for a number of years. Those classes will cease to exist because most of the members of those water aerobics classes would be unable to tread water for 60 minutes.

Your scope of who will enjoy swimming or learning to swim in the new pool is extremely narrow. And yet all of us are expected to pay for it. Please reconsider.

Sincerely,
Christine Free

Hi there,

I am a mom of 2 kids (9 and 6) and would like to say that I am disappointed that the pool plans don't include a shallow end. The separate pool is not enough for families. Please consider adding in a shallow end. Without that the pool will be much less useful for us.

Thanks!
Beth McNeill

Hi,

I am a Piedmont resident and enjoyed the Piedmont pool before the reconstruction planning began. I was disturbed to learn that the design plans for the large pool have it being 7 feet deep without a shallow area for swim classes and learning? As a community pool, funded by all of our tax dollars, it should be available to families who want their children to learn to swim.

Why we would even consider building a community pool that is so deep is hard to understand. I realize the water polo team might need such a pool, but the community cannot undertake such an extreme cost to build a pool for such a small group.

Our kids are 9 and 6 and currently don't have any good options for swim lessons in our area. That audience should be at the top of the list of pool stakeholders, and having a learning area to the pool is critical.

Cheers,
Sean Byrnes

Dear City Council,

My family of 3 young children - 6 months, 4yo, and 6 yo moved to Piedmont last year in hopes for all the amazing family oriented things this city has to offer. We are extremely disappointed to hear that the new "community" pool, that our tax dollars are funding, will not include a shallow end. It is extremely short sighted to spend all this money on a pool for this community that has so many young children. We've had to find swim lessons for all three children in neighboring cities (Alameda, Berkeley, and Oakland) and are urging you to please reconsider this decision. Water safety is critical for children to learn and without a proper facility to do so, the city is putting our next generation at a disadvantage.

Thank you,
Julie Ortiz

I just learned that plans for the new pool do not include a shallow end where swimmers can stand but rather will be 7-feet deep at its shallowest. I would like to voice my opinion that 7 feet is too deep. Please include a shallow end that can be enjoyed by families with younger swimmers and non-swimmers alike.

Thank you,
JinAh Lee

Dear City Council,

Please consider building a medium sized pool for families and children to enjoy. I have been taking the 5th graders to the end of year pool party for about 17 years. The 5th graders have always loved the medium sized pool even if they do pass the swim test for the lap pool. It is fun for water volleyball, playing, splashing, etc when you don't feel like treading constantly.

Thank you for reading this.
Katy Hix Levin

Dear Piedmont City Council:

I write in favor of the current pool design and against making a shallow lane in the deep pool. The proposed shallow lane will interfere with running scrimmages east to west with two teams (eg, varsity and JV) practicing at once. Piedmont's student athletes deserve a real competition pool and I understand there is accommodation for other needs during rec hours in the current design.

Thanks,

Josh Hurwitz

Dear City Council-

I have 2 waterpolo players and swimmers. We cannot wait for this pool to be built. Please keep the deep water. I am not in favor of adding a shallow section across the whole west or east side of the deep water pool. This will interfere with water polo practice when we run waterpolo scrimmages from west to east to allow for more than one team to practice at the same time. It will make the pool slower for swimmers. The change is being billed as needed so people have a place to stand in the deep pool, but there is already a place to stand in the spur on the south side where the stairs are and two shallow "love seats" in the niches for the floating goals. And the whole deep pool is well suited to water fun during rec swim — people can float in inner tubes, play Marco Polo, dive for rings, jump off the diving boards, etc. without changing the design. Adding shallow water is a mistake. Please do not do this.

Best,
Julie Stein

Hello Piedmont City Council,

We are writing to advocate for keeping the entire deep water pool deep, i.e. we would rather not have a shallow section across one side of the deep water pool. Keeping the whole pool deep will enable more water polo players and teams to practice and scrimmage at the same time. It will also keep the pool fast for swimmers.

We believe that the pool complex will end up being "fun and recreational" no matter the design. Therefore, it is crucial to maintain a configuration that will optimize the pool for competitive sports. As I wrote in my previous email to the City Council, a useful sports pool is an essential need in our community. Local families and students currently drive all over the Bay Area at all hours in order to attend water polo and swimming practices and games. Let's be efficient and keep these practices and competitions here in Piedmont by building the optimal pool for sports.

Thank you,
Christine Wente and Roland von Metzsch

City Council,

My son plays water polo and is in 5th grade. We and at least 20 other families drive through the tunnel for our kids' water polo practice at Acalanes, Miramante, and Campolindo 4 days a week. We were thrilled when the Piedmont pool passed and the timing is perfect for our group of kids to play water polo IN Piedmont.

It has been brought to my attention recently that the design keeps changing and there is a possibility with the vote tonight that the pool will become a lot less water polo friendly. Water Polo is a very up and coming sport and will only keep getting more popular over the next 10 years. It would be a shame to approve a design that would keep Piedmont sports from growing.

We voted for the pool and will be disappointed if our kids need to still be going out of Piedmont for practice due to the design.

Please vote to keep the “Water Polo Friendly” plan for the pool.

Elizabeth and Gregor Watson

Hello Piedmont City Council,

We are writing to advocate for keeping the entire deep water pool deep, i.e. we would rather not have a shallow section across one side of the deep water pool. Keeping the whole pool deep will enable more water polo players and teams to practice and scrimmage at the same time. It will also keep the pool fast for swimmers.

We believe that the pool complex will end up being “fun and recreational” no matter the design. Therefore, it is crucial to maintain a configuration that will optimize the pool for competitive sports. As I wrote in my previous email to the City Council, a useful sports pool is an essential need in our community. Local families and students currently drive all over the Bay Area at all hours in order to attend water polo and swimming practices and games. Let’s be efficient and keep these practices and competitions here in Piedmont by building the optimal pool for sports.

Thank you,
Colleen Alan and Brian Payne

From: [Brett Byers](#)
To: [Sara Lillevand](#); [Paul Benoit](#); [Chelle Putzer](#); [City Council](#)
Subject: consider chlorine vs saline pool
Date: Monday, May 02, 2022 11:21:48

Dear Sara, Paul, Chelie and City Council,

Further to my emails below, I add this input below in bold, passed on from Richard Perez, with quite a bit of knowledge in this area. Richard has convinced several very high end apartment buildings in San Francisco to convert their pools to saline. Building owners and managers and residents all are very happy, the the building managers believe that the saline pool (vs a chlorine pool) had a significant impact in reducing tenant turnover and allowing for increases if rent from what they otherwise would have been.

My friend Richard is a brilliant and very successful technology investor.

Sincerely,
Brett Byers, [REDACTED]

On May 1, 2022, at 10:47 PM, Richard Perez <[REDACTED]> wrote:

If the pool is heated and doesn't really get that cold, then a salt based pool wouldn't require extra work. But if the pool was outside and not covered and not heated and the temperature plummeted, then a salt based pool might require more attention. I have read that. But during cold months most pools are shut down anyway. The outdoor Equinox pools during the winter months are heated and covered at night, so the salt based pools I think still operate normally. They should call the Equinox to find out how the Equinox solves their potential maintenance extra work problem?

On Sunday, May 1, 2022, Brett Byers <[REDACTED]> wrote:

This seems contrary to this part of the language from the consultant (from my prior email forwarded to you from Sara):"

" However, in a public pool application these salt systems have proven problematic. The first challenge is that the electrolytic cell cannot adjust its chlorine production to cater to the varying demands of chlorine for a public pool. The amount of chlorine needed in the middle of the day in August is much different than three in the morning in January. As a result, the saltwater pools typically operate with higher levels of chlorine to ensure the chlorine residual is never depleted below the code requirements. "

How do you reconcile what is above with what you have written below?

On May 1, 2022, at 7:29 PM, Richard Perez <[REDACTED]> wrote:

PS. From a cost point of view, ordinary chlorine based pools require constant monitoring of the water chemistry(and different chemicals may have to be added to bring it to par) whereas with salt based pools, monitoring costs are way way less.

Maybe look at the readings every now and then. And salt added here and there, rather than adding chloramines pucks all the time for the old fashioned chlorine system. And labor is not cheap.

Begin forwarded message:

From: Brett Byers <[REDACTED]>
Subject: Re: Thank you re: Pool electrification; consider chlorine vs saline pool
Date: May 1, 2022 at 7:19:15 PM PDT
To: Brett Byers <[REDACTED]>
Cc: Sara Lillevand <slillevand@piedmont.ca.gov>, Paul Benoit <pbenoit@piedmont.ca.gov>, Chelle Putzer <cputzer@piedmont.ca.gov>, citycouncil@piedmont.ca.gov

Sara,

Further to this and no doubt of great significance to Piedmont, I would add that ordinary chlorine based pools can generate the chemical compound called chloramines which are nasty, especially if swimmers pee in the pool or too many swimmers release bodily fluids such as sweat, which also create strong chloramines. This new compound causes eye irritation, flaky skin, and might negatively affect the lungs, besides discoloring hair and cloth. Salt based pools generate a purer chlorine which does not seem to mix with things like ammonia (causing chloramines). Thus the water is way safer/healthier for average swimmers. Also ordinary chlorine tablets/pucks have additives which might be toxic even before creating chloramines.

I cannot imagine that Piedmont residents would want to be exposed to chloramines.

Sincerely,
Brett

Sent from my iPhone

On Apr 29, 2022, at 4:01 PM, Brett Byers <[REDACTED]> wrote:

Sara,

Your consultant is at odds with what others are doing and has given you a very slanted view of the issue. For a \$20 million dollar projects, you need to hire another consultant that can give you the opposite view, perhaps one that has consulted for the building of a local public saline pool.

I note that metal corrosion issues can be eliminated by using non-metal fixtures in and around the pool.

There are a number of public and club saline pools very near by. I will name just

a few here, based on information on the internet:
Temescal Oakland Public Pool
Richmond Plunge
Clarke Memorials Swim Center, Walnut Creek
Larkey Park Swim Center, Walnut Creek
El Cerrito Swim Center
Equinox Health Clubs
Claremont Country Club (part saline)

It would be very unfortunate and a massive disservice to Piedmont to not hire an consultant that has a different view from your consultant. There are certainly many, given the many public and club pools that are saline.

Saline has a huge advantages to chlorine as I outline below. It would be a great pity if you deny these to Piedmont residences in reliance on a perhaps ill-informed consultant - maybe with no experience with saline and certainly at odds with the practices of many other public pools.

Sincerely,
Brett

On Apr 24, 2022, at 3:35 PM, Sara Lillevand <slillevand@piedmont.ca.gov> wrote:

Hi Brett

Sorry for the delayed response to your question/concern regarding chlorine v. saline. Below is the explanation received from Dennis Berkshire, President of Aquatic Design Group. Thanks for engaging in this process of building a new Community Pool.
Kind regards,
Sara

Sara Lillevand
City Administrator
City of Piedmont
510-420-3040

It was Michael Faraday, the famous physicist, that discovered in the mid 1800's that when he applied DC electrical current to salt water he could liberate or evolve elemental gas chlorine. To this day all chlorine worldwide is made from this process. California Health and Safety Code in the California Code of Regulations, Title 22, Section 65529, Public Pool Disinfection, requires that all

public pools maintain a residual of chlorine to protect the public from enteric illnesses such as E.coli, Giardia, and Cryptosporidium. A public swimming pool must maintain a chlorine residual of 1.0 ppm to 10 ppm at all times it is open for use.

Some people choose to use an on-site chlorine generation system to provide the chlorine rather than purchasing a commercial chlorine product such as liquid chlorine (sodium hypochlorite or calcium hypochlorite). There are three types of onsite chlorine generators: an elemental gas chlorine generator, a liquid hypochlorite generator, and a salt water electrolytic system. Since gas chlorine is an acutely toxic gas public pools do not use the gas chlorine option. A hypochlorite generator makes a very weak sodium hypochlorite solution of approximately 0.7% to 0.9% compared to purchased laundry bleach which is 4.75% sodium hypochlorite or liquid chlorine which is 12.75% sodium hypochlorite. As such the hypochlorite systems have proven to less than ideal for a public pool application.

A common misnomer about saltwater systems is that they replace a chlorine system, when in fact they are one. A saltwater system operates by adding approximately 5,000 parts per million of salt to the pool water. This dissolved sodium chloride is then pumped through an electrolytic cell producing DC electrical current. The current will make a small amount of chlorine within the pool water itself. The pool still maintains the chlorine residual of 1 ppm to 10 ppm as required by California Code. These saltwater systems can work for a residential pool that is not regulated by health code and generally constructed with all plastic pool equipment materials. However, in a public pool application these salt systems have proven problematic. The first challenge is that the electrolytic cell cannot adjust its chlorine production to cater to the varying demands of chlorine for a public pool. The amount of chlorine needed in the middle of the day in August is much different than three in the morning in January. As a result, the saltwater pools typically operate with higher levels of chlorine to ensure the chlorine residual is never depleted below the code requirements. The second challenge with a saltwater pool is the electrolysis it imparts into the pool water. Any piece of metal with contacts or receives this electrical current becomes a sacrificial anode and can be eaten up. Our public pools have bronze pumps and impellers, metallic heater exchangers and other metallic components all of which can be sacrificial components and have greatly reduced lifespans. The byproduct of any chlorinated water is a salt residual in the forms of chlorine once the chlorine has been spent. If someone wants higher levels of salt in the pool water, they can do so regardless of the chlorine source and type maintained in the pool. We typically do not add such salt as the salt is an electrolyte that increase the potential for conductivity and can add more maintenance and sustainability problems.

-----Original Message-----

From: Brett Byers <[REDACTED]>

Sent: Tuesday, April 5, 2022 7:54 PM

To: City Council <CityCouncil@piedmont.ca.gov>

Subject: Thank you re: Pool electrification; consider chlorine vs saline pool

Begin forwarded message:

From: Brett Byers <[REDACTED]>
Subject: Thank you re: Pool electrification; consider chlorine vs saline pool
Date: April 5, 2022 at 7:54:08 PM PDT
To: citycouncil@piedmont.ca.gov

Dear City Council,

Thanks very much for your commitment to electrifying the Piedmont pool!

I would ask that you consider a saline pool rather than chlorine. I do not think that your current process is doing this, as you (and your pool committee) are relying entirely on a general design firm that likely has no significant expertise in this area but does have a vague and common bias towards chlorine.

Saline has many advantages including:

1. Substantially less expensive in the long run: slightly higher up front capex, but way lower chemical costs.
2. Health advantages, as chlorine causes very dry skin and hair, and can stir up allergies and migraines and perhaps worse.
3. Saline is much more pleasant: no chlorine smell while swimming, no chlorine smell in hair and on body that does not go away with a shower, no smell in bathing suits, no early degradation of swim suits.

Piedmonters have high standards and a standard chlorine pool is below what many prefer. You likely do not hear much from many of such folks, as they have long ago moved to higher end pools such as the two private Claremont pools (hotel and country club), the Oakland Hills Tennis and Swim Club, and Equinox, and thus have limited interest in the Piedmont pool, current or future. Others, without a convenient and economical saline pool option, may merely choose to not join a chlorine Piedmont pool.

Many folks have significant issues with chlorine and cannot swim very often (not often enough for regular exercise) in a chlorine pool. Further, even for occasion users, a saline pool is far more pleasant, especially after one has been tried. Note that some folks do not even know of the existence of saline pools or have not tried one, so one must do some educating to get an accurate survey of preferences.

I would suggest that you find a firm that is truly expert in this area to advise you, and that you consider the number of Piedmonters that might prefer a saline pool after educating them on the differences and the significant advantages of a saline pool.

Thanks very much,
Brett